



न्यूक्लियर पावर कॉर्पोरेशन  
ऑफ इंडिया लिमिटेड

(भारत सरकार का उद्यम)

**NUCLEAR POWER CORPORATION  
OF INDIA LIMITED**

(A Govt. of India Enterprise)

विक्रम साराभाई भवन,  
मध्य मार्ग, अणुशक्तिनगर,  
मुंबई - 400 094.

Vikram Sarabhai Bhavan,  
Central Avenue Road, Anushaktinagar,  
Mumbai - 400 094.

दूरभाष / Phone : (0) 022-2550 7773, 2599 1205

फैक्स / Fax : 022-2599 1208

ई-मेल / E-mail : nnagaich@npcil.co.in

नलिनीश नगाइच

अधिशासी निदेशक (सी पी एवं सी सी)

**Nalinish Nagaich**

Executive Director (CP & CC)

NPCIL/ED(CP&CC)/2011/M

April 19, 2011

**A Rejoinder: No fear factor in the 'Nth Factor'**

Dear Sir,

This is in response to an article titled "The Nth Factor" by Debarshi Dasgupta that appeared in the issue dated March 28, 2011 of your esteemed magazine Outlook. After going through the article, however, we find that there are certain inaccuracies in the article that may lead to spreading of misconceptions about nuclear energy among your readers. It is our duty to put the correct picture before you.

At the outset, we would like to assert that nuclear power plants in India are operated with utmost regard to safety with no exceptions. Based on the philosophy of "defence-in-depth," incorporating proactive new-generation safety features incorporated in multiple redundant safety systems with ample of safety margins, our plants are capable of safe operation even under severely stressful circumstances. Nonetheless, there are lessons to be learned from the recent events in Japan, and the Nuclear Power Corporation of India Ltd. (NPCIL) is committed to incorporating additional measures for taking the existing safety to even greater level.

In the said article, the writer has highlighted ten points that have been rather erroneously termed as "mishaps" at Indian nuclear power plants. The use of the word mishap in itself is inappropriate, as the writer himself has preferred to use the expression "small mishap" in a subsequent section in the story. **These events were of no radiological consequence either to environment or the people.** It may be noted that such incidences are common to all industries – oil, power, heavy industry, mining etc.

As for the provisions of the Environmental Protection Act in the context of nuclear power plants, the claim made in the said article is surprising. In fact, all nuclear power plants strictly comply with the prevailing laws regarding water and air pollution.

In the context of seismicity, Indian nuclear power plants have ample of safety margin that go well beyond the 'Seismic Zones' that they are meant to operate in. Detailed geological studies conducted before setting up a nuclear power plant dictate the

पंजीकृत कार्यालय : सेन्टर-1, 16 वाँ तल, विश्व व्यापार केन्द्र, कफ परेड, कुलाबा, मुंबई - 400 005

Regd. Office : Centre-1, 16<sup>th</sup> Floor, World Trade Centre, Cuffe Parade, Colaba, Mumbai - 400 005

safety imperatives related to seismicity and provisions and margins for these factors are incorporated right at the design stage.

Evolution of design is an ongoing process in all products and in all industries. Take any example say cars, each new model has evolved from the experience and feedback of the earlier model. The thermal power plants which were of 50 MW and less in 1950s have evolved to 100, 250, 500 MW and 660/800 MW at present. Can we say that the later models of cars or thermal power plants are untested and reject them?


Similarly, the high-capacity nuclear power reactors based on international cooperation are in fact evolutionary in design, meaning that they already incorporate proven and time-tested designs of yesteryears in an improved manner along with innovative design features that ensure "additional" safety even under extremely challenging situations. Indeed, several countries in the world are currently implementing these technologies. Thus the comment in the article about "untested" features of these reactors is incorrect and out of context.

To summarize, we would also like to mention that safety has always been of prime importance in nuclear power plants in India, and multiple safety measures are always in operation. As the company responsible for operating the atomic power stations and implementing the atomic power projects for generation of electricity, NPCIL is committed to continually improve occupational health, safety and environmental performance of its nuclear power plants.

We hope that you shall favourably consider this rejoinder for publication in the next issue of your magazine. We are always ready to provide any other information or clarification that your writers may be seeking to know regarding the nuclear power scenario in India.

Thanking You,

Yours Faithfully,

  
(N. Nagaich) 19/04/2011

**Mr. Vinod Mehta**  
The Editor-in-Chief  
Outlook Magazine.  
Head Office :  
AB – 10, S. J. Enclave,  
New Delhi – 110 029.